Carbon Neutrality & Electric Vehicles in Toronto's Financial District

June 2022



CONTENTS

SUMMARY	1
BACKGROUND	2
Net Zero	2
Electric Charging Basics	2
Low-Emission & Zero-Emission Vehicles	2
A Common Goal	2
INTRODUCTION	3
TransformTO	
Short-Term Implementation Plan	
Toronto Green Standard	
Net Zero Existing Buildings Strategy	
Electric Vehicle Strategy	4
Charger Installations	4
Current Implementation	4
IMPACTS & CHANGES	6
Infrastructure	6
Traffic	6
Public & Private Space	6
OTHER CITIES	7
New York City	7
Montréal	7
Vancouver	9
Boston	9
REFERENCES	I

By 2030, 30% of cars in Toronto should be electric, and transit reliability should increase (Corporate Services, 2021).

SUMMARY What's here?

- The impacts of climate action strategies, including Toronto's *Electric Vehicle Strategy*, on the Financial District's public realm.
- High-level analysis of infrastructure requirements, traffic impacts, and the use of public and private space.
- Jurisdictional scan of other similar strategies in comparable cities.

Toronto, like most North American cities, has agreed to have no net greenhouse gas emissions by 2050. This is part of the C40 cities' agreement, related to the Paris climate change agreement. Toronto is aiming for a 2040 net-zero date as Council believes the city can and should meet the deadline ten years early.

However, this will require continuous and determined change. The City of Toronto has set out several interlocking strategies to make the 2040 date. This will, necessarily, affect existing & new buildings and public spaces downtown, including in the Financial District.

This is an overview of common net-zero and electric vehicle (EV) terms and technologies, a look at Toronto's current strategies on this front, how these strategies may affect the Financial District's public realm, and what other cities are doing.

Toronto's strategies start lightly and slowly become more restrictive over time. This is intended to reduce drastic change in exchange for continuous gradual change. New buildings are targeted first, with retrofits for existing buildings coming later. Larger and City buildings are expected to lead the way, with changes such as on-site electricity generation, natural gas being phased out, and car charging capability being installed in all new parking spots (both public and private).

This is anticipated to make the public realm more enjoyable for the public: traffic and noise will be reduced, outdoor surfaces will be cleaner, and shaded gardens will be more common.

Toronto is positioned well in comparison to other cities. New York, Montréal, Vancouver, and Boston all have similar strategies, and Toronto has already started implementation, like all the cities on this list. Toronto's builtform plans are in good company, but it lags in its implementation of its transportation and EV policies. However, determination is the important factor, and in that regard, Toronto's plans with their technical backing and specific steps are well-placed.

1

BACKGROUND What is "net zero" and what does that entail?





Level 2 J1772 (topleft ~), Level 3 CCS1 (top-right ?) & Level 2+3 CHAdeMO (bottom J) plugs. ~J1772 fits CCS 12 but not the reverse.



are considered Level 3, but since they are proprietary, they tend not to be ignored. Teslas can plug into any Level of charger with an adaptor, but other vehicles cannot plug into Tesla chargers.

Electric cars do not have to fully charge to be useful. Charge times

useful. Charge times are often given in km/h or km/min (range per charging time), so a driver can charge only as much as they need to.

Payment for charging can either be done by the hour (like a traditional parking spot), by the unit of electricity (kWh) (like a building's hydro meter), or a hybrid model (such as by kWh while charging, and by time when done). Charging by time prevents loitering and frees up unused chargers (Vancouver, 2016).

NET ZERO

"Net zero" is a goal where greenhouse gas emissions are reduced as much as possible. For any remaining emissions, these are "offset" by taking the equivalent gases out of the air and storing them permanently (Toronto & Live Green Toronto, 2021a).

Many (if not all) net-zero strategies rely on "heat pumps": an air-conditioner-like machine that can move heat outside in the summer and capture heat from winter air and move it inside, too. They are incredibly efficient, and compatible with any building that already has an air conditioner.*

Some net-zero strategies (although not Toronto's) rely on "renewable natural gas" (RNG): natural gas that is not mined, but is produced from decomposition or synthetic processes. It is intended to be interchangeable with natural gas (Con Edison et al., 2021).

ELECTRIC CHARGING BASICS

Electric cars or electric vehicles (EVs), are essentially the same as existing gasoline-powered vehicles, except they are powered by batteries which need to be plugged in to charge. Such cars can plug into a standard wall socket to charge, but they often have their own chargers, which decrease charging time significantly. These are classified into "levels":

- Level 1: A standard 120V wall socket. These take about 24 hours to charge, and are typically last resorts.
- Level 2: A 240V charger, typically plugged into a dryer/stove outlet installed by an electrician. These tend to come with two types of car plugs (top-left) and are the most common. These take about 6 hours to charge.

 Level 3: "Fast-chargers" that take about 45 minutes to charge. These are rare, and not installed in homes.[†]

(ChargeHub, 2020; Pollution Probe & Delphi Group, 2018; New York City Mayor's Office of Sustainability & New York City DOT, 2021)

LOW-EMISSION & ZERO-EMISSION VEHICLES

A "low-emission vehicle" (LEV) is any vehicle that does not create many emissions in operation, such as a hybrid, small engine, or natural-gas car (U of T Mississauga, 2020).

A "zero-emission vehicle" (ZEV) is any vehicle that does not produce toxins in operation. This includes electric cars and hydrogen cars (Pollution Probe & Delphi Group, 2018).

Once cities have legally defined these vehicles (typically by adopting state, provincial, or federal standards), they can set up Low-Emission Zones (LEZs) and Zero-Emission Zones (ZEZs). These are areas of the city where only vehicles meeting these requirements are allowed to drive. This differs from, and is not mutually exclusive with, a congestion charge, which tolls drivers in certain areas or at certain times for the privilege to drive on the street (Dunsky Energy Consulting, 2019, *Action 5*).

A COMMON GOAL

All of the cities investigated here are C40 cities: they have committed to take action to help meet the Paris Climate Agreement. North American cities are expected to be world leaders, and as such, many have similar goals (Google, 2022a).

Plug illustrations by Great-Drok - Own work, CC BY-SA 4.0, https://commons. wikimedia.org/w/index. php?curid=48432293

^{*} This video series provides an excellent summary of heat pumps: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7J-52mDjZzto&list=PLv0jwu7G_DFVIot1ub0ZdR-KC-LFd0Vqi&index=1

[†] A Level 3 charger cannot charge a Level 2 car, but Level 3 cars can charge on Level 2 chargers; i.e. chargers are not downwards compatible, but cars are. Level 3 charging is an option on some cars (General Motors of Canada Company, n.d.). See **sidebar** for standardized plugs used in North America.

INTRODUCTION What is Toronto doing?

Nothing happens in a municipality until a by-law says it does. As such, a plan or strategy is just an idea until it is implemented by by-law.

As such, not all policies shown here may be the rule. An effort has been made to track down applicable Toronto by-laws, but this is not intended to be a complete or official list of North American net-zero implementations.

TransformTO

Toronto's main net-zero strategy is called *TransformTO* and has been enacted by by-law (TransformTO - Critical Steps for Net Zero by 2040, 2021).

TransformTO implements several other plans and policies that each contain specific actions for various parts of city life. TransformTO itself was created based on recommendations from an earlier technical report (Toronto & Live Green Toronto, 2021b). Other plans and policies also exist in Toronto that are not part of TransformTO, but nonetheless complement it.

TransformTO standards become gradually more restrictive over time to meet Toronto's 2040 net-zero goal. Early adopters of upcoming standards are rewarded, typically with property or development tax rebates (Deputy City Manager & Toronto, 2021; Toronto & Live Green Toronto, 2021b). In this way, the City expects no changes to be too drastic. The strategy calls upon other strategies for implementation, sorted by category:

SHORT-TERM IMPLEMENTATION PLAN

This part of TransformTO contains direct steps that Toronto can take before 2025 to meet their intermediate 2030 goals. New construction standards are implemented, public outreach is started, and the first phase of existing building plans start which include annual emissions



STEERING COMMITTEE MEM

C40 cities have made a declaration to collectively halve their greenhouse gas emissions by 2030 to keep with the Paris Climate Agreement (Google, 2022a). As such, member cities in North America can all be expected to have similar climate strategies (Montréal, 2019).

reporting, initial natural gas phase-out, and zoning modifications to allow easy installation of green technologies. Mainly, however, the City will be taking this time to implement and test their strategies themselves. Electric vehicles and bikes will also be phased in, with 30% of Toronto vehicles electric by 2030; ActiveTO will be expanded, and electric delivery options will be encouraged in the form of electric trucks or e-bikes. Major changes for existing buildings generally do not occur in this plan; the City is focusing on changing new construction and habits (Corporate Services, 2021).

TORONTO GREEN STANDARD

Enacted by its own by-law (Toronto Green Standard Review and Update, 2021) and encouraged by TransformTO, the *Toronto Green Standard* applies to buildings being built. It is sorted by category (residential, commercial, and industrial) and then size, with different standards that must be met for each category. Checklists are available for simplicity. It is available in different "Tiers", with higher, stricter tiers being voluntary (with reward) for now, but gradually becoming mandatory (Toronto, 2022).

NET ZERO EXISTING BUILDINGS STRATEGY

This is the Toronto Green Standard for existing buildings. The City will provide support for smaller buildings, but expects large buildings to lead by example. As this is not part of the Short-Term Plan, there are no hard targets, yet. Up-front costs are expected to be high, but operations costs will be lower while providing cleaner air and improved comfort. Heat pumps are strongly encouraged, but the City sets targets, not methods, so there is flexibility in implementation. Large buildings should consider generating their own electricity. Buildings will be required to publicly report their progress (to encourage compliance). Early adopters will be supported with tax rebates (Deputy City Manager & Toronto, 2021).



ELECTRIC VEHICLE STRATEGY

The *Electric Vehicle Strategy* is enacted by its own by-laws and the City has already started implementation (Dunsky Energy Consulting, 2019; On-Street Electric Vehicle Charging Stations - Pilot Conclusion and Next Steps, 2022). It compliments TransformTO.

The Electric Vehicle Strategy sets goals for the number of electric car chargers installed, area types the City will be focusing on, financing possibilities, and potential effects on City life.

The City will prefer to install chargers near public amenities such as washrooms, parks, and shelters; near businesses with a lot of car commuters; in residential neighbourhoods with long-distance drivers; and other areas identified as high-priority and capable of supporting charging infrastructure.

The City suspects that once adequate home chargers are installed, downtown chargers may not be used as much, however, visible public chargers are important in reducing range anxiety (where drivers worry that their car will run out of batteries) and normalizing electric cars. The City of Toronto appears to see charging as an overnight at-home task, and so is not currently investing much in Level 3^{*} fast-chargers or municipal downtown chargers. City policy is silent on visitors and tourists, who would presumably benefit from, and look for, high-quality chargers.

Once sufficient chargers have been installed and electric car uptake is on the rise, a Low-Emission Zone (LEZ) may be implemented.

Electric cars will make streets quieter (like King St E is today) and will reduce the need for cleaning, as electric cars produce less soot (Dunsky Energy Consulting, 2019).

CHARGER INSTALLATIONS

Currently, the City is conservative about deciding where to put chargers: to minimize impact, essentially only existing, rarely-used spots are converted. Parking must already be allowed at all hours. This will evidently have to change if electric car charging is expected to catch on. The City realizes this and is currently finalizing its installation plan, to be released in 2023 (Dunsky Energy Consulting, 2019).

* Which Toronto calls "DCFC" for Direct-Current Fast Charging

CURRENT IMPLEMENTATION

The City has currently installed eight chargers to see how the program will work. They have been met with mild success, and the City will install 32 by the end of 2022 (On-Street Electric Vehicle Charging Stations - Pilot Conclusion and Next Steps, 2022). New chargers will primarily be installed in residential areas, as home charging is more popular and public charging can be provided by private companies. These municipal chargers have been and will be used to experiment with pricing. Currently, hourly prices with different rates for night and day have been found to be effective. Current prices are approximately the same as a standard paid spot, but may increase slightly (Toronto & Transportation Services, 2022).



WHAT'S WHAT'S

Toronto's green strategies are made up of many interlocking parts that together are intended to make life in the City more comfortable and meet the City's 2040 Carbon emission goals (TransformTO - Critical Steps for Net Zero by 2040, 2021).

Toronto's green strategies encompass all aspects of city life, with many similar strategies that are intended for different sectors. For example:

Net Zero Existing Buildings Strategy	→	Existing Private Buildings
Net Zero Carbon Plan	→	City Buildings
Toronto Green Standard	→	New Buildings
Electric Vehicle Strategy	→	Public Realm

5

IMPACTS & CHANGES What could happen in the Financial District:

INFRASTRUCTURE

- Natural gas will be phased out, heat pumps will be phased in (Corporate Services, 2021)
- All parking spots will, eventually, have to have car chargers installed (Pollution Probe & Delphi Group, 2018, p. 30)
- Large buildings should generate their own electricity to help power their new car chargers (Deputy City Manager & Toronto, 2021)
- Public chargers will be installed near washrooms, shelter, green space, businesses, and employers with long-distance commuters; but homes will be prioritized (Dunsky Energy Consulting, 2019, p. 15)
- City of Toronto may offer bulk pricing on new technologies to reduce costs (Deputy City Manager & Toronto, 2021, p. 89)

TRAFFIC

- A LEZ may be implemented (Dunsky Energy Consulting, 2019, p. 21)
- Driving will be encouraged as a last resort after active transportation, public transit, and shared vehicles (Toronto, 2021)
 - » Less street space will be devoted to cars (Toronto & Live Green Toronto, 2021b, p. 54)

- Electric scooters may become more common, and could be available at bike-share stations (Dunsky Energy Consulting, 2019, p. 9)
- Cargo bikes may replace trucks for deliveries, especially in dense areas (Pollution Probe & Delphi Group, 2018)
- Bike parking spots will become mandatory at TTC stations (TransformTO-Critical Steps for Net Zero by 2040, 2021, p. 5)

PUBLIC & PRIVATE SPACE

- For new construction, high-quality bike parking will have to be provided (Toronto, 2022)
- Public gardens with bike parking may be formed from reclaimed space (Toronto, 2019, p. 105: *Fairford Parkette*)
- Hard surfaces will be partially phased out to reduce stormwater runoff and to provide more shade as part of "Green Streets" (Toronto, 2022)





Current location of publicly-accessible private & municipal chargers in downtown Toronto (Google, 2022b). City-run chargers (right) make up a small



subset of this (Toronto & Transportation Services, 2022), with most chargers being in privately-owned parking.

OTHER CITIES What are other jurisdictions doing?

Montreal

Map data ©2022 Google, INEGI

To an extent, the story is the same everywhere: cities will have to undergo an extensive green retrofit, governments and large landowners will have to lead the way, and how society thinks of transportation will have to change. However, the implementation of this varies by culture and geography, with each city having its own take. Toronto does not have all the ideas, but is generally on-par with these cities. Some notable features of each city's strategies are presented here:

NEW YORK CITY

Vancouver

New York's plans deviate from Toronto in two significant ways: charging is an urban attraction, not just an at-home activity, and deliveries feature prominently.

New York City currently has an extensive truck management plan, and their new strategy, *Delivering New York*, plans to build on that. BIAs are going to be leveraged to co-ordinate deliveries: buildings will coalesce their deliveries, deliveries will be to central self-serve postoffice-like hubs, and off-peak deliveries will be encouraged. New York expects to slowly transition trucks to electric, which will require downtown chargers, and to increase the amount of cargo bikes in the city to reduce the amount of trucks overall (New York City DOT, 2021).

Electrifying New York is the main electric car plan. New York, like Toronto, expects electric cars to be a last resort to be used after all other forms of transport are exhausted. To increase electric car uptake, electric cars will receive toll discounts and access to HOV ($\langle \rangle$ diamond) lanes, and exciting electric branding will be used (some-

- Other cities emphasize branding
- Vancouver makes their plans simple and easy-to-follow, with different levels of detail available
- Policy is similar by city (with emphasis on 2050 & 2030 goals), but presentation differs
- Toronto phases out natural gas, other cities phase it in
 - Other cities do not have ready access to nuclear or hydro electricity^{*}
- New York emphasizes trucks & delivery ("goods movement")

^{*} This may be no longer be true in Toronto if Pickering Nuclear closes in 2025 without replacement (Chown Oved & Lorinc, 2022)



Map data ©2022 Google, INEGI thing Toronto lacks) (New York City Mayor's Office of Sustainability & New York City DOT, 2021). Electricity will be paid by amount used (New York, 2022), not time, with the potential for drivers to buy a metered cord to plug into any available public hydro pole (New York City Mayor's Office of Sustainability & New York City DOT, 2021). Level 2+3 quick chargers will be installed in community hubs to attract drivers to local businesses, with the rapid charging encouraging turnover. 80 are expected by 2025 (Gastel & Morales, 2021). There are currently 92 "curbside" Level 2 chargers. This does not include parking-garage chargers, and more chargers are to be installed soon (New York, 2022). The City of Toronto currently sees limited use for municipal Level 3 chargers, although is prepared to upgrade to them in the future (Pollution Probe & Delphi Group, 2018; Dunsky Energy Consulting, 2019).

MONTRÉAL

Montréal's strategy mainly focuses on shrinking transportation and making new construction more eco-friendly.

Montréal currently has a pilot project that, like New York, uses post-office-like delivery hubs where trucks drop off their wares and small electric trucks or bikes will then complete the delivery in the neighbourhood. Eventually, each neighbourhood will have one of these (Montréal, 2021).

On the passenger side, Montréal is promoting electric bikes, with 725 added to the municipal rental fleet in 2021 for a total of 2100 across the city (Luft, 2021).

In terms of electric cars, 600 new chargers will be added by 2023, plus 60 fast-chargers. There are currently 1000 municipal chargers in the city. By 2023 a LEZ will be established and by 2030 a ZEZ. Montréal hopes to encourage electric industries to come to the city, and hopes to host expos to show electric innovation and to promote electric cars to drivers (Montréal, 2021).

In terms of building construction, like Toronto, Montréal will publicly rate buildings to help ensure compliance. *Bioclimatic* (i.e. integrated and working with its environs) buildings will be preferred in permit approval.

PRESENTATION

HOW DO THESE PLANS LOOK TO THE PUBLIC?

Environment & Energy Division City of Toronto Metro Hall

Metro Hall 55 John Street, 2nd Floor Toronto, ON M5V 3C6

Related Information

Email: tra

TransformTO

Air Quality

Expand All + Collapse All -

-

Federal EV Incentive I

Used EV incentive @

Toronto Green Stands

Energy Retrofit Loans

TTC Green Ini

Home Energy Loan Program

The Pathway to Sustainable City of Toronto Fleets

TORONTO

Toronto's GHG emissions. This means that switching from fossil fuel-powered vehicles to electric vehicles is important for reducing GHG emissions in Toronto and meeting the City's goal of achieving net zero GHG emissions by 2040.

Electric vehicles have other benefits, too. They cost less to operate and don't have tailpipe emissions, helping to reduce air pollution. They are also quiet, helping to reduce noise pollution.

Integring to recuce noise polaution: More information about EV is a available on the Plug'in Drive website.¹² You can test-drive an EV and learn more about EVs a the Electric Vehicle Discovery Centre¹². Plug Phive is a non-profix organization committed to accelerating the adoption of electric vehicles in order to maximize their environmental and economic benefits.

Electric Vehicle Strategy

Toronto's first Electric Vehicle (EV) Strategy in was approved by City Council on January 29, 2020.

With a focus on the electrification of passenger vehicles (cars, vans, trucks and SUVs) the Strategy identifies 10 actions the City can take to: increase charging valiability, address cont and convenience barriers, increase public avareness and education, and create economic opportunities that will benefit the local economy Passenger cars and trucks accounted for about 26 per cent of OHG emissions in Toronto in 2019.

Read the EV Strategy Staff Report in for more information

Assessment Phase

Assessment in tase The City contracted Pollution Probe and The Delphi Group to lead the development of a comprehensive review of the current electric mobility landcape, existing policies, barrier and opportunities, best practice, convence key stakeholders and assess these findings to create a baseline. The assessment phase report was used to inform the Strategy actions. Learn more: Electric Mobility Strategy Assessment Phase Report ib

Consultation

The City engaged the public and stakeholders through multiple workshops and a public online survey to help co-create the Electric Vehicle Strategy. Learn more: Electric Vehicle Strategy Consultation Summary ib-

Learn more: Electric Venicle Strategy Consultation Summary 📾

TransformTO – Toronto's Climate Action Strategy

TransformTO is Toronto's ambitious climate action strategy. Unanimously approved by Chy Council In July 2017, it includes a set of long-term, lowcathor opais and strategies to reduce local greenhouse gas emissions and improve our health, grow our economy, and improve social equity. On October 2, 2019, Chy Council voted unanimously to declare a climate emergency and accelerate efforts to mitigate and adpt to climate change, adopting a stronger emissions reduction target of net zero by 2050 or sooner.

MONTRÉAL

Last updated May 19, 2022 • Reading time: 2 m

Related Climate change

By 2023, Montréal wants to increase and diversify the supply of electric transportation by developing more sustainable, affordable and accessible mobility options The Transportation Electrification Strategy will help the city achieve this goal.

By working with civil society and business, Montréal intends to:

- Shift as many trips as possible to public transit and shared modes of
- Improve the energy performance and efficiency of the
- transportation system

Six key orientations

The new version of the Transportation Electrification Strategy highlights the diversity of the means deployed and the partnerships involved.

- 1. Focus on active and collective transport
- Work in collaboration with the Société de transport de Montréal to ensure that 84 per cent of all trips are on electric vehicles, including
- Ensare that on per cert of all this are on electric vehicles, including buses and the subway.
 Enhance shared electric mobility services by adding 2,100 electric Bixi bikes and 250 electric taxis.

2. Make charging electric cars easier by:

- Installing 600 new level 2 public charging stations and 60 public fast
- charging stations; • Proposing regulation that requires owners of all new residential buildings with parking areas to install basic electrical infrastructure to which charging stations can be connected.
- to which charging stations can be connected.
 3. Reduce the nuisance caused by freight transport by electrifying fleets
- Encourage the electrification of urban freight transportation so that
 500,000 packages are delivered annually by electric modes.
- 500,000 packages are delivered annually by electric modes. • Establish new urban logistics spaces to serve a larger territory and more boroughs.
- 4. Replace all of the city's end-of-life sub-compact vehicles with electric models. For other classes of vehicles, opt for electric models, where

NEW YORK



BOSTON I AM LOOKING FOR...





Taking a brief look at the public-facing "homepages" of each of these strategies shows that Toronto's is very text-heavy (like New York's).

Conversely, Vancouver and Boston offer friendlier websites with a "choose-yourown adventure" style of organization.

Branding and communication will be important if the public is to get on-board and such plans are to succeed.

Boston uses a "I want to know about..." format that is common to their municipal website and encourages public interest (Pike, 2021).

Montréal, while not having a homepage, has a series of easyto-read lists in press releases, with the full plan attached for those who want more detail (Montréal, 2022).



Vancouver's plan is easily laid out with branches and increasing levels of detail as requested.

Summarized translations are available, too.

Goals are given consistent names ("Big Move N²") throughout all Vancouver green strategies so they can be easily cross-referenced and tracked.

> A carbon budget will be published for the city and its neighbourhoods that will attempt to distribute allowable emissions equitably, and destruction of unsold textiles will be banned to encourage textile recycling (Montréal, 2020).

VANCOUVER

Vancouver is unusual because, unlike the other cities here, it has two levels of government. Metro Vancouver sets regional goals and leaves implementation to subsidiary municipalities, like the City of Vancouver.

Metro Vancouver sets emissions goals for the region, and their *Clean Air Plan* focuses heavily on zero-emission transportation of all kinds. They hope to achieve this by "putting a price on driving" by replacing car parking with bike parking, offering viable alternatives to driving, and by promoting electric vehicles. Companies will be expected to create and keep *comprehensive* carbon budgets. (This includes all emissions: not just building emissions, but employee travel emissions and the like, too.) (Vancouver, 2021) The City of Vancouver currently has a stopgap solution for electric car owners without a garage to charge in at home: the city is permitting car owners to lay their charge cable across the sidewalk, provided it is approved and covered with a small ramp (Vancouver, n.d.-e).

Vancouver has already experimented with car chargers. There was a program where building owners could request a charger on a first-come, first-served basis (Vancouver, n.d.-a). Three charging hubs have been installed with the help of TELUS at some of their cell towers in three parks (Vancouver, n.d.-c). Landlords of pre-2011 buildings with a space can request a charger for a fixed price and the City will take care of the rest (Vancouver, n.d.-b). This is in keeping with City policy that requires all new residential parking to be charger-ready (Vancouver, n.d.-d).

By 2030, 90% of Vancouverites should be within a walk of their daily needs, and $\frac{2}{3}$ of trips should be by active or public transport. This will require road space reallocation, and by 2025, tolls will be charged to drive downtown. Building car parking minimums will be replaced with maximums, electric car drivers will have access to HOV ($\langle \rangle$ diamond) lanes, and permits will be required to park at home (Vancouver, n.d-g, *Making it happen*; Vancouver, n.d.-d).

Charging hubs are currently limited in Vancouver, as there is British Columbian regulation around who is allowed to sell electricity. However, once this is resolved, charging hubs are expected to be included in community redevelopments & parking lots, and residential chargers can be installed in groups near homes to save costs. In commercial areas, fast chargers will be installed since Vancouver's research shows that regular Level 2 chargers in these areas have little effect on electric car uptake. These will also be useful for commercial fleets with no "home" charger. Car charging is expected to become a competitive advantage landlords and employers can offer, and Vancouver expects that car charging will eventually be completely privatized (Vancouver, 2016).

In terms of buildings, like Toronto, Vancouver has slowly tightening emissions standards, although Vancouver's apply to larger buildings first. All buildings are expected to be net zero by 2040, like Toronto, although unlike Toronto, renewable natural gas is included in this strategy (Vancouver, n.d.-f).

BOSTON

Boston's goals, while similar, are conveyed much more boldly. Boston is focusing on reducing solo drivers' numbers drastically, like Toronto, but is much more up-front about it (Boston, 2022).

9

70 new plugs are expected to be installed this year, at a discounted cost of \$2400ea. for the City, provided by their electricity supplier, Eversource. Charging will be 25¢/kWh, not by time. By 2023, Boston would like a charger in each neighbourhood (Wintersmith, 2021). By 2025, Boston should have a total of 1055 chargers and 320 fast chargers. And by 2040, each house should be within a 10-minute walk of a free charger or electric car share.

As such, Boston sees electric chargers as neighbourhood hubs. Grouping chargers will make installation easier and promote community (Boston Transportation Department, 2020).

The City of Boston will soon start experimenting with cargo bikes, and will construct 40km (25 miles) of new bus lanes by 2030 to try to reduce solo drives by half. Extensive walking and biking infrastructure will be installed, with communities and hired non-profits assisting. This is something a BIA could help with.

"Flexible curbs" mean street parking spots that are reused for other purposes, such as cafés or markets, and will be trialled. Toronto currently has a similar, albeit more specific program, CaféTO. Street parking costs will also be automatically adjusted by time and demand (Boston & Walsh, 2019).

While Boston's policies are young, their communication is on-point and bold.

CHARGER COMPARISON LOOKING AT FINANCIAL DISTRICTS ACROSS THE UNITED STATES AND CANADA.*

* Maps from ChargeHub https://chargehub.com/en/charging-stations-map.html



Current location of chargers in downtown New York.







Current location of chargers in downtown Toronto.



Current location of chargers in downtown Vancouver.

GOVERNANCE STRATEGIES WHO IS EXPECTED TO DO WHAT IN DIFFERENT CITIES?

СІТҮ	CHARGERS SHOULD BE MAINLY	ELECTRICITY IS PROVIDED BY	CHARGERS SHOULD BE INSTALLED BY	CHARGERS SHOULD BE INSTALLED	CHARGING FEE IS
TORONTO	Public or private with public as- sistance (eventu- ally)	Public hydro company	Hydro company	On quiet streets in busy areas, [*] or in parking garages	\$2/h daytime, \$3 flat rate over- night outside downtown [†]
NEW YORK	Public	Private electri- city company‡	Municipality and landowners	In parking lots, on-street, and in community & business hubs	35¢/kWh
MONTRÉAL	Public (provin- cial)	Public prov- incial hydro company§	Municipality, with help from provincial hydro company (with exceptions)	On-street [¶]	\$3/h or less; or up to \$10 flat rate**
VANCOUVER	Privatized ^{††}	Public prov- incial hydro company [#]	Private de- velopers (with assistance from City)	At home and in community hubs	12¢-27¢/minute ^{s§}
BOSTON	Public	Private electri- city company ^{¶¶}	Hydro company (mainly)	In neighbour- hoods	25¢/kWh, then \$1/h when not charging

https://www.bchydro.com/toolbar/about.html

¶¶ https://www.nyse.com/quote/XNYS:ES

^{*} This apparent contradiction could be why the City of Toronto has not installed many chargers.

[†] Subject to slight increase soon (Toronto & Transportation Services, 2022, p. 10).

thttps://www.conedison.com/en/about-us/corporate-governance/political-engagement

[§] https://www.hydroquebec.com/about/governance/acts-regulations.html

[¶] https://montrealgazette.com/news/local-news/montreal-unveils-electric-car-charging-network

^{**} https://lecircuitelectrique.com/en/cost/

^{††} BC legislation currently restricts who can sell electricity, so while Vancouver foresees chargers being private, currently chargers are run by BC Hydro.

^{§§} https://electricvehicles.bchydro.com/how-use-our-fast-chargers/how-much-does-it-cost-charge-fast-charging-station

REFERENCES

- Boston, C. of. (2022, August 2). *Recharge Boston: Boston's Zero Emission Vehicle Program* [Municipal]. Boston.Gov. https://www.boston.gov/departments/transportation/ recharge-boston-electric-vehicle-resources
- Boston, C. of, & Walsh, M. M. J. (2019). *2019 Update* (No. 4; Climate Action Plan). City of Boston. https://www. boston.gov/sites/default/files/embed/file/2019-10/ city_of_boston_2019_climate_action_plan_update_4. pdf
- Boston Transportation Department. (2020). *Zero-Emission Vehicle Roadmap*. City of Boston. https://www.boston. gov/sites/default/files/file/2020/10/Boston%20 ZEV%20Roadmap_1.pdf
- ChargeHub. (2020). *Electric Vehicle Charging Guide*. https:// chargehub.com/en/electric-car-charging-guide.html
- Chown Oved, M., & Lorinc, J. (2022, May 9). Ontario energy grid emissions set to skyrocket 400% as Ford government cranks up the gas. *Toronto Star*. https:// www.thestar.com/business/2022/05/09/ontarioenergy-grid-emissions-set-to-skyrocket-400-as-fordgovernment-forced-to-crank-up-the-gas.html
- Con Edison, Drexel University, Energy Futures Initiative, ICF, National Grid, & New York City Mayor's Office of Sustainability. (2021). *Pathways to Carbon-Neutral NYC: Modernize, Reimagine, Reach*. New York City Mayor's Office of Sustainability. https://www1.nyc.gov/ assets/sustainability/downloads/pdf/publications/ Carbon-Neutral-NYC.pdf
- Corporate Services, D. C. M. (2021). *TransformTO Net Zero Strategy Short-term Implementation Plan 2022-2025*. City of Toronto. https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/ mmis/2021/ie/bgrd/backgroundfile-173757.pdf
- Deputy City Manager, C. S., & Toronto, C. of. (2021). *Net Zero Existing Buildings Strategy* [Report for Action].
- Dunsky Energy Consulting. (2019). *City of Toronto Electric Vehicle Strategy* (IE11.17-Attachment 1). Environment & Energy Division. https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/ uploads/2020/02/8c46-City-of-Toronto-Electric-Vehicle-Strategy.pdf
- Eshel, K. (2021, January 14). *City of Boston 2019 Climate Action Plan Update*. ArcGIS StoryMaps. https://storymaps.arcgis.com/stories/ cd9140272cf74aa9997836b3cf1d5349
- Gastel, S., & Morales, A. (2021, September 8). NYC DOT Releases Plan to Create One of the Largest Municipal Electric Vehicle Charging Networks. DOT Press Releases. https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/html/pr2021/plancreate-largest-municipal-electric-vehicle-chargingnetworks-september-08-2021.shtml
- General Motors of Canada Company. (n.d.). *Electric & Plug-In Hybrid Cars, Vehicles*. Chevrolet Canada. Retrieved June 1, 2022, from https://www.chevrolet.ca/en/electric
- Google. (2022a). *C40 Cities* [World]. C40 Cities. https:// www.c40.org/cities/

- Google. (2022b). *Find every public charging station for electric cars* [Map]. https://chargehub.com/en/ charging-stations-map.html
- Luft, A. (2021, August 16). Plante administration unveils plan to increase electric transportation in Montreal. *CTV News*. https://montreal.ctvnews.ca/planteadministration-unveils-plan-to-increase-electrictransportation-in-montreal-1.5549162
- Montréal. (2019, May 6). Carbon Neutrality Objective | The city announces a first step towards carbon neutrality for its real estate assets [Municipal]. Ville de Montréal - Official City Portal - News Releases; Ville de Montréal. http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/portal/ page?_pageid=5977,43117560&_dad=portal&_ schema=PORTAL&id=31553
- Montréal. (2020). *Climate Plan 2020–2030*. Montréal. https://portail-m4s.s3.montreal.ca/pdf/climate_ plan_2020_2030_vdm.pdf
- Montréal. (2021). *Transportation Electrification Strategy* 2021-2023. Ville de Montréal. https://portail-m4s. s3.montreal.ca/pdf/strategie_electrification_des_ transports_2021-2023_ang_finale.pdf
- Montréal. (2022, May 19). *Transportation Electrification Strategy 2021-2023: Toward Sustainable Mobility* [Municipal]. https://montreal.ca/en/articles/ transportation-electrification-strategy-2021-2023toward-sustainable-mobility-17859
- New York City DOT. (2021). *Delivering New York: A Smart Truck Management Plan for New York City*. NYC DOT. https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/downloads/pdf/ smart-truck-management-plan.pdf
- New York City Mayor's Office of Sustainability & New York City DOT. (2021). *Electrifying New York*. NYC Department of Transportation. https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/ downloads/pdf/electrifying-new-york-report.pdf
- New York, C. of. (2022, May 18). *Electric Vehicles*. NYC DOT. https://www1.nyc.gov/html/dot/html/motorist/ electric-vehicles.shtml#/find/nearest
- Pike, A. (2021, August 1). How to Write Docs People Read. *Allen Pike*. https://allenpike.com/2021/how-to-writedocs-people-read
- Pollution Probe, & Delphi Group, T. (2018). *City of Toronto Electric Mobility Strategy Assessment Phase* [Final]. City of Toronto. https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/ uploads/2021/12/932d-Toronto-Electric-Mobility-Strategy-Assessment-Phase-Report.pdf
- Toronto Green Standard Review and Update, PH25.17 (2021). http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/ viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2021.PH25.17
- TransformTO Critical Steps for Net Zero by 2040, IE26.16 (2021). http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/ viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2021.IE26.16
- Ι

Toronto, C. of. (2019). *Toronto's First Resilience Strategy* (Resilience Strategy). https://www.toronto.ca/servicespayments/water-environment/environmentallyfriendly-city-initiatives/resilientto/

Toronto, C. of. (2021). Summary of Public and Stakeholder Consultation (City of Toronto Electric Vehicle Strategy). Toronto Environment and Energy Division. https:// www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/9339-Toronto-EV-Strategy-Engagement-Summary.pdf

Toronto, C. of. (2022). *TGS Version 4.0 Checklist: Mid to High Rise Residential and all New Non-Residential Development* (Toronto, Ontario, Canada). City of Toronto. https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planningdevelopment/official-plan-guidelines/toronto-greenstandard/toronto-green-standard-version-4/midto-high-rise-residential-non-residential-version-4/ checklist-templates/

On-Street Electric Vehicle Charging Stations—Pilot Conclusion and Next Steps, IE30.11 (2022). http:// app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory. do?item=2022.IE30.11

Toronto, C. of & Live Green Toronto. (2021a). *Technical Report* (TransformTO Net Zero Strategy). City of Toronto. https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/ uploads/2022/01/8f16-Technical-Report.pdf

Toronto, C. of & Live Green Toronto. (2021b). *TransformTO Net Zero Strategy* (Toronto, Ontario, Canada). City of Toronto. https://www.toronto.ca/services-payments/ water-environment/environmentally-friendly-cityinitiatives/transformto/

Toronto, C. of, & Transportation Services, G. M. (2022). *On-Street Electric Vehicle Charging Stations—Pilot Conclusion and Next Steps* (IE30.11) [Report for Action]. Infrastructure and Environment Committee. https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2022/ie/bgrd/ backgroundfile-225839.pdf

U of T Mississauga. (2020, March 31). *Eco Park Program*. Parking. https://www.utm.utoronto.ca/parking/ alternative-transportation/eco-park-program

Vancouver, M. (2021). *Clean Air Plan*. Metro Vancouver. http://www.metrovancouver.org/services/airquality/about/clean-air-plan/Pages/, http://www. metrovancouver.org:80/services/air-quality/about/ clean-air-plan/Pages/default.aspx

Vancouver, C. of. (n.d.-a). *Curbside Electric Vehicle Pilot Program* [Municipal]. City of Vancouver. Retrieved May 19, 2022, from https://vancouver.ca/streetstransportation/curbside-electric-vehicle-pilot-program. aspx

Vancouver, C. of. (n.d.-b). *Electric vehicle charging for rental buildings* [Municipal]. City of Vancouver. Retrieved May 19, 2022, from https://vancouver.ca/streetstransportation/electric-vehicle-charging-for-rentalbuildings.aspx Vancouver, C. of. (n.d.-c). *Electric vehicle charging station* and cellular poles in English Bay parks [Municipal]. City of Vancouver. Retrieved May 19, 2022, from https:// vancouver.ca/streets-transportation/electric-vehiclecharging-stations-and-cellular-poles.aspx

Vancouver, C. of. (n.d.-d). *Electric Vehicles (EVs)* [Municipal]. City of Vancouver. Retrieved May 19, 2022, from https:// vancouver.ca/streets-transportation/electric-vehicles. aspx

Vancouver, C. of. (n.d.-e). *EV charging extension cords on sidewalks* [Municipal]. City of Vancouver. Retrieved May 19, 2022, from https://vancouver.ca/streetstransportation/electric-vehicle-cord-cover-licence. aspx

Vancouver, C. of. (n.d.-f). *Green large commercial and multi-family buildings* [Municipal]. City of Vancouver. Retrieved May 20, 2022, from https://vancouver.ca/ green-vancouver/green-large-commercial-and-multifamily-buildings.aspx

Vancouver, C. of. (n.d.-g). *How we move* [City of Vancouver]. Climate Emergency Action Plan. Retrieved May 20, 2022, from https://vancouver.ca/green-vancouver/how-wemove.aspx

Vancouver, C. of. (2016). *Vancouver's EV Ecosystem Strategy*. City of Vancouver. https://vancouver.ca/files/cov/evecosystem-strategy.pdf

Wintersmith, S. (2021, December 17). Boston aims to tamp down vehicle emissions with more electric charging stations. *GBH*. https://www.wgbh.org/news/ politics/2021/12/17/boston-aims-to-tamp-downvehicle-emissions-with-more-electric-chargingstations



JUNE 2022